

[Home](#)[Allah](#) [AbdurRahman.org](#) » [sunnah](#) »[Arabic Learning](#) [Articles](#)[Audio](#) [Audio](#)[Aqeedah](#) [eBooks](#)[Character](#)[Comparitive Rel](#)[Dawah](#)[Death-Hereafter](#)[eBooks](#)[Fatawa](#)[Family](#)[Hadith](#)[Hajj](#)[Health](#)[Hijrah](#)[Imaan](#)[Innovation](#)[Islam](#)[Jihad](#)[Knowledge](#)[Money](#)[Muhammad](#)[Quran](#)[Ramadhan](#)[Salah](#)[Scholars](#)[Science](#)[Search](#)[Seerah](#)[Sins](#)[Sunnah](#)[Tafseer](#)[Tahara](#)[Tawheed](#)[Ummah](#)[Women](#)[Zakat](#)[Zikr&Dua](#)[Misc](#)[My YahooGroup](#)[Telugu](#)[Site Map](#)[Links](#)[COOLjsMenu](#)

Why did the Imâms Differ?

by Shaykhu-l-Islâm Ibn Taymiyyah (d. 728 AH / 1328 CE)

<http://www.islaam.net>

This article is taken from the beginning of Shaikh ul-Islam's (r) treatise " Raf-ul-M A'lâm (Removing the Harms from the Noble Imâms)".

In this treatise, the Shaikh (ra) discusses the reasons why the famous and righteous [by the masses of Muslims, differed in some issues and contradicted the est Messenger of Allâh(swt) in some cases. He lists over ten reasons in the intro However this article only contains the first one. However, it is the most importa Taimiyyah (ra). And it is for this reason, as the Shaikh says, that many of th contradict the Sunnah, can be explained and acknowledged. Thus, there is no defic scholars. Rather, they were rewarded in their correctness as well as in their errors. on them. This article was translated by Isma'îl ibn al-arkân. The notes where t Shâwîsh's comments and footnotes to this treatise, unless otherwise specified.

~*~*~

All praise is due to Allâh for His countless blessings. I bear witness that none has th except Allâh, He stands alone and with no partners, whether on His earth or in His h witness that Muhammad(saw) is His slave, Messenger and the last of His prophets. eternal peace and continuous blessings upon him, his family and his companions un shall all meet Him.

To proceed:

It is binding upon the Muslims, after declaring loyalty to Allâh and his Messenger, t believers as is stated by the Qur'ân. This especially includes the scholars, for they ar prophets. And they are the ones whom Allâh has given the status of bearing the sim which guidance is achieved in times of darkness, on land and on sea. The Muslims c agreed upon their guidance and their knowledge.

Before the advent of our Prophet, the scholars of every nation were the worst of its p the case with the Muslims, for indeed their scholars are the best from among them. successors of the Messenger (saw) in regards to his nation and they are the ones wh caused to die from his (saw) Sunnah. It is through them that the Qur'ân is establishe are established. Through them the Qur'ân is articulated and through it, they are artic

It must be known that there is not one scholar, who is accepted widely and willfully purposely intends to oppose the Messenger of Allâh(swt) in any aspect of his (saw) or large. For indeed, they all agree on the obligation of following the Messenger(saw certain understanding. They also agree that one can accept or reject the statement of mankind, except that of the Messenger of Allâh. ^[1]

Therefore when it is found that an opinion, held by one of them, contradicts an auth doubt that excuses must be made for him, in explanation to his abandoning of it. Th divided into three categories:

1. The lack of his believing that the Prophet s said it
2. The lack of his believing that particular issue was affected by that statement
3. His belief that that ruling was abrogated

These three categories can be subdivided into numerous reasons:

The first Reason: The Hadîth did not reach him

Anyone that does not have a hadîth that reaches him is not responsible for being obligation. Thus, if a hadîth was not conveyed to him, and he formulated an opinion either the apparentness of an obligating ayah, another hadîth, the necessity of Qiyâ: [2], then sometimes he may be in agreement with that hadîth and at other times he m

For the most part, it is due to this reason that many of the statements of the Salaf ha to the reports mentioned in some ahâdîth. For certainly, it is not possible for a completely grasp (all) of the hadîth of the Messenger of Allâh .

The Prophets would narrate hadîth, issue religious verdicts, pass judgements or co whosoever was present there would hear him or see him. These people w (information) to other groups or to just some individuals whom they would reac affair would end up with whomsoever Allâh(swt) willed, from the scholars among and those who came after them.

Then in another gathering, he would again narrate hadîth, issue religious verdi conduct other matters. And some of the people that were absent from the first gat They would then convey it to whomsoever they were able to convey it to. So possess some knowledge that those people did not and those people would posse these individuals did not. And verily, the scholars among the Sahâbah and thos distinguished from one another due to who possessed more knowledge or who bo whether one single person can encompass all of the hadîth of the Messenger of . impossible.

An example of this is seen in the rightly guided khalîfahs, who were the most know concerning the affairs of the Messenger of Allâh, his Sunnah and his states of bei with Abu Bakr As-Siddîq who never separated from the Prophet(saw), whether journey. Rather, he was with him the majority of the time, even to the point that talking to him about the affairs of the Muslims. This goes the same for 'Umar Prophet(saw) would say many times:

"Abu Bakr, 'Umar and I entered..." and "Abu Bakr, 'Umar and I left..."

In spite of this, when Abu Bakr was asked on the inheritance of the grandmother, he

"There is nothing for you in the Book of Allâh nor have I learned of anyth of the Messenger of Allâh that is for you. However, I will ask the people."

So he asked them and Al Mughîrah Ibn Shu'bah and Muhammad Ibn Maslamah sto

"that the Prophet has given her a sixth (of the inheritance)." [3]

This aspect of the Sunnah was conveyed to 'Imrân Ibn Husain, also. These three in to Abu Bakr nor to any of the other (four rightly guided) khalîfahs in terms of kn

were specifically characterized with knowledge of this Sunnah – of which its action by the ummah.

Likewise, 'Umar did not know the Sunnah for asking permission to enter a household of it by Abu Mûsâ Al-Ash'arî, who called on the Ansâr as witnesses. [5] This possessed more knowledge than the one who told him of this aspect of the Sunnah.

Also, 'Umar did not know that a woman was supposed to inherit from her (deceased) money, but instead he held the opinion that the blood money belonged to the 'iqilâ Dahhâk Ibn Sufyân Al-Kulâbî, who was a leader of some Bedouin Arabs (Al-Bawâ Allâh, wrote to him and informed him that:

"The Messenger of Allâh(swt) gave the wife of Ashyam Ad-Dabâbî, the blood money of her (deceased) husband." [7]

So he abandoned his opinion in favor of that (hadîth) and said:

"Had we not heard of this, we would have ruled in opposition to it."

Also, he did not know the regulations of the Majûs in regards to their payment of the blood money. This was until 'Abd-ur-Rahmân Ibn 'Awf informed him that the Messenger of Allâh

"Treat them like the people of the House (Ka'bah)." [8]

And when 'Umar arrived at Sargh [9] and news reached him that there was a plague in the land, he consulted the Muhâjirîn that were with him, then from the Ansâr, then from the Ansâr present at the Conquest (of Makkah). Everyone of them advised him according to his own opinion and not one of them informed him of the Sunnah (in regards to this situation). 'Abd-ur-Rahmân Ibn 'Awf arrived and informed him of the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allâh and that he(saw) said:

"If it breaks out in a land while you are in it, then do not leave from it by fleeing, and if you hear news that it has broken out in a land, then do not go near it." [10]

And he and Ibn 'Abbâs were reminded of what should be done when one has died in a land, whether or not he has broken his ablution. And the Sunnah for that affair was not known until 'Abd-ur-Rahmân Ibn 'Awf informed him that the Prophet(saw) would

"Cast away all doubts and work upon that which he was certain of." [11]

And one time 'Umar was on a journey when a wind began to blow violently, so he began to

"Who will narrate to us a hadîth concerning the wind?"

Abu Hurairah said:

"News of this reached me while I was in the last rows of people (on the journey) and I was riding my animal until I reached him. Then I narrated to him, what the Prophet(saw) commanded should be done at the time when the wind is blowing." [12]

In these instances, 'Umar did not have knowledge of these matters, until those who terms of knowledge, conveyed it to him. In other instances, the aspect of the Sunnah (which he knew of) was not conveyed to him and so he ruled or gave a verdict in opposition to what he gave a ruling concerning the blood tribute to be paid for the (loss of one's) life according to their uses. In spite of this, Abu Mûsâ and Ibn 'Abbâs, who were rich in knowledge, knew that the Prophet(saw) said:

"This and this are equal"

– meaning the thumb and the little finger. [13]

This aspect of the Sunnah was also conveyed to Mu'awiyah during his leadership according to it, and the Muslims found no other alternative but to follow that. So the only reason of deficiency in 'Umar, for the hadîth did not reach him.

Also, he as well as his son 'Abdullâh Ibn 'Umar and other righteous people used to abstain (in state of Ihrâm) from putting on perfume, before going into the state of Ihrâm : Makkah, after the casting of the pebbles at 'Aqabah. And the hadîth of 'Umm 'ishah did she said:

"I perfumed the Messenger of Allâh(swt) for the occasion of his Ihrâm before he went to Makkah and for his hill (disembarking from the state of Ihrâm), before he went to Makkah (circumambulating)." [14]

Likewise, he used to command the one who was wearing khuffs to wipe over them if he had sandals on, without restricting a fixed period of time for doing it. Many opinions were given in that matter and they were not conveyed the ahâdîth in which the time period was mentioned. And these ahâdîth are authentically transmitted by some of the companions who had an equivalent status to him in knowledge. Furthermore, information on this matter has been conveyed to the Messenger of Allâh(swt) through numerous authentic narrations. [15]

The same goes for 'Uthmân for he did not possess knowledge that the woman who was to complete her 'iddah (waiting period) in her (deceased) husband's home. This hadîth of Furai'ah Bint Mâlik, the sister of Abu Sa'îd Al-Khudrî, in regards to her husband died. And it was that the Prophet(saw) told her:

"Remain in your (husband's) home until the fixed period of time has been completed."

So 'Uthmân based his opinion on this (hadîth). [16]

And one time he was given some hunting game, which was caught just for his purpose, about to eat it, when 'Alî Ibn Abî Tâlib informed him that:

"The Prophet(saw) returned some meat that was presented to him as a gift."

Similarly, 'Alî said:

"Whenever I heard a statement (hadîth) come from Allâh's Messenger, with what He willed for me to benefit from it. However, when I heard a statement from anyone else, I would make him take an oath on it, so if he would swear then believe him. And once Abu Bakr related a hadîth to me, and he spoke

Then he mentioned the famous hadîth of the prayer of repentance. [18]

Also he, 'Ibn 'Abbâs and others declared the ruling that the woman whose husband was pregnant, had to complete the longer of the two waiting periods. And the Sunnah of (swt) concerning this matter in the case of Subai'ah Al-Aslamiyyah did not reach her husband, Sa'ad Ibn Khaulah, died, the Prophet(saw) ruled that

"her waiting period is to endure until she gives birth." [19]

Also, he along with Zaid, Ibn 'Umar and others ruled that a woman that is married in another land, if her husband dies, that she receives no dowry. In this example, the Sunnah of Allâh(swt) concerning the case of Barwa' Bint Wâshiq did not reach them. [20]

Discussion on this topic is extremely vast, such that the reports on the companions of Allâh(swt) concerning it are numerous and many. As for the reports concerning it from those who came after them, then taking account of all of them is in itself beyond the reach of thousands. And it must be kept in mind that these four companions were the most knowledgeable, the most understanding, the most submissive and fearing, as well as the most beloved to the entire ummah. And those who came after them are much lower than them in this regard. It is likely that some aspects of the Sunnah would be unknown to them. And this needs to be kept in mind.

So whoever believes that every hadîth that was conveyed to one of the Imâms or the Prophet(saw) is authentic, then he is mistaken. And that is a vile and detestable mistake.

And no one should say: "Indeed (all) the hadîth were transcribed in books and collected in books hidden from anyone?" This statement is far from correct for indeed these transcripts, which are well-known in the books of Sunnah, were only collected after the death and disappearance of the Prophet(saw) whom are followed by the people, may Allâh have mercy on them. In spite of this, it is not to be claimed that all of the hadîth of the Messenger of Allâh(swt) are limited to certain books.

And even if one were to limit all of the hadîth of the Messenger of Allâh(swt) to such books that was in these books was not known to a scholar, nor can this be attained by any one man, many records of transcribed ahâdîth and he would not be able to access them. Rather, the ones who existed before these books of transcribed ahâdîth were more knowledgeable of the Sunnah than those who came after them. This is because the hadîth were conveyed to them and considered authentic in their opinion, did not reach us except through a chain of narration or it was not conveyed to us in its complete form where they would transcribe the ahâdîth was in their hearts – and there would be no recorded transcriptions held within them. This is one matter from the knowledge of the Prophet(saw) there is no doubt.

And no one should say: "Anyone that doesn't know all of the ahâdîth cannot be a mujtahid if it were a condition for a mujtahid to have knowledge of everything that the Prophet(saw) said concerning matters related to rulings, then this ummah would never see this type of scholar. The extent of a scholar is only: that he knows a majority or a great part of the ahâdîth, but there will remain anything unknown to him except for a few cases from the general whole. These few cases from the general whole (that are unknown to him), can oppose what was conveyed to him from knowledge."

1. This is a saying that can be attributed to the Salaf, among them Imâm Mâlik (ra).

2. Translators note: This term refers to the deducing of a verdict based on the evidence to forbid it. This applies to only matters outside the field of belief and w family and social affairs. And Allâh knows best.

3. Al-Albânî said in Irwâ-ul-Ghalîl (no. 1680): “It is reported by Abu Dawûd ar hadîth of Qabîsah Ibn Dhu’aib in mursal form. It has different paths of narrat including the hadîth of ‘Imrân Ibn Husain.”

5. Reported by Al-Bukhârî in his Sahîh from Abu Sa’îd Al-Khudrî. See Fath-ul-Bârf

6. Translators Note: A group of people that saw to it that the blood money was prop knows best.

7. Reported by Ahmad, Abu Dawûd and At-Tirmidhî, who said it was a hasan sa Ghalîl (no. 2649)

8. Ash-Shâfi’î reported it in his Musnad in mursal form and it has other paths of 1 with this same wording. Ahmad, Al-Bukhârî, Abu Dawûd and At-Tirmidhî report “He would not collect the jizyah (money tribute) from the Majûs until ‘Abd-ur-R: witness that the Messenger of Allâh took it from the Majûs of Hajr.”

9. This is an area of land located in the last parts of Shâm and the first parts of Hijâ and Tabûk.

10. Reported by Ahmad, Al-Bukhârî and Muslim from ‘Abd-ur-Rahmân Ibn ‘Awf

11. Al-Albânî said: “Ahmad, Muslim, Abu Dawûd and At-Tirmidhî reported it, Sa’îd Al-Khudrî. As for the report of ‘Abd-ur-Rahmân Ibn ‘Awf, then Ahmad, At-reported it with the wording:

‘If one of you should get doubt in his prayer, such that he does not know if he (raka’ahs), then he should make it one...’

And there is no mention of ‘casting away the doubts’ and ‘building upon what one : stated by the author, may Allâh have mercy on him.”

12. Al-Albânî said:

“It is that which Muslim has reported in his Sahîh from ‘Aa’ishah(ra)that wind would blow violently, the Prophet (saw) would say:

‘O Allâh, I ask You for the good of it, the good of what is found in it a You send with it. And I seek refuge in You from the evil of it, the evil o and the evil of what You send with it.’

And it is what Abu Dawûd and Ibn Mâjah have reported on Abu Hurairah Messenger of Allâh say:

‘The wind is form the spirit (rûh) of Allâh. It comes with mercy and it con So if you see it, then do not revile it. But (instead) ask Allâh for the good in Allâh from the evil of it.’

And it is a hasan sahîh hadîth as has been stated by Al-Hâfidh Ibn Hajr (ra

13. Reported by Al-Bukhari, Abu Dawûd, Ibn Mâjah and An-Nasâ'î from Ibn 'Abbâs (ra).
14. An agreed upon hadîth (i.e. reported by Al-Bukhârî and Muslim).
15. Al-Albânî said:

“Ahmad and Muslim reported it from the hadîth of ‘Alî. And Ahmad, At-Tirmidhî and Muslim reported it from the hadîth of Khuzaimah Ibn Thâbit. And it has the hadîth of Safwân Ibn ‘Assâl(ra)by An-Nasâ'î, At-Tirmidhî and Ibn Mâjah. The last two authenticated it. Ad-Dâraqutnî reported it and authenticated it, as from the hadîth of Abu Bakrah. These ahâdîth provide evidence for the time spent over the footwear, which is one day and one night for the resident and one day and one night for the traveler.

At-Tirmidhî said: ‘This is the opinion of the scholars from the Companions (saw) as well as those that came after them from the Fuqahâ.’”

16. The compilers of the Sunans reported this and At-Tirmidhî, Ibn Hibbân, authenticated it. It is from the hadîth of Furai'ah Bint Mâlik. See Al-Musnad (6/370)
17. Reported by Ahmad in Al-Musnad (1/100 & 104)
18. Al-Albânî said:

“Ahmad, Abu Dawûd, At-Tirmidhî and Ibn Mâjah reported that A Messenger of Allâh(swt)say:

‘There is no person that commits a sin, then performs ablution and perfects his prayer, he prays two raka'ahs and thereafter asks Allâh for forgiveness, except that he will forgive him.’

Then he(saw) recited this ayah:

'And those who when they commit evil acts or they wrong themselves, they ask forgiveness for their sins. And who forgives sins, except Allâh. And those who do what they do, while knowingly. These are the ones whose reward will be from their Lord and gardens under which rivers flow, to abide therein forever. That is the reward of those who do (good) deeds.' [Surah 'Alî 'Imrân 135-136]

Al-Hâfidh Ibn Hajr said that this hadîth has a good chain of narration.”

19. Reported by Al-Bukhârî, Muslim, Abu Dawûd and Ibn Mâjah with close and sirr.
20. Reported by Imâm Ahmad and the compilers of the Sunans. At-Tirmidhî authenticated it. His husband was Hilâl Ibn Murrah Al-Ashja'î.